聖学院学術情報発信システム ： SERVE

SEigakuin Repository for academic archiVE

Comparative Observations on Theories of Internally-generated Development

—— An Aspect in the Thought of Edward Carpenter and Ishikawa Sanshiro ——

Atsuko INADA

内発的発展論の比較思想的考察
——エドワード・カーペンターと石川三四郎の思想的接点をめぐって（Ⅱ）——

稲　田　敦　子

エドワード・カーペンターと石川三四郎の思想的接点としての内発的発展論の基底には，社会関係における「機能－役割」的関係から「実体－人格」的関係への再生の可能性をさぐる試みがある。この試みは，カーペンターの「調和的社会論」および石川の「複式網状組織論」で提起されているが，本稿では，これらの試みを中心にして内発的発展論の問題を検討することを課題とする。

　石川三四郎は，イギリスのミルソープでカーペンターと生活を共にしたことからも，思想的交流をより深めた。特にカーペンターの "Spiritual Democracy" は，石川独自の「土民生活」思想を展開する契機となったものである。このことは石川がさらに，新しい変革主体を軸とした共同体の再編成の可能性を求め，「複式網状組織」の実践を試みにいたることにつながるものとなった。この石川の「複式網状組織論」およびカーペンターの「調和的社会論」には，それぞれの「網のつなぎ目」への視点があり，それが固有価値論への契機となっている。固有価値論をめぐる問題は，主体の問題にあわせて，文明の個性的継承の視点から地域の個性と内発的発展および地域の固有価値を相互に活かし合う発想に展開されていくものである。エドワード・カーペンターと，石川三四郎の思想的接点として，この固有価値論は，大きな位置をしめるものである。この固有価値をめぐる個性と多様性を認識することが，個における内発性とともに内発的発展の可能性の契機となるであろう。

I. Meaning of internally-generated development

Theories of internally-generated development seek to paper over the many deficiencies rife in theories of modernization or to be processes of social change that are designed to protect

against those deficiencies. The bearer of internally-generated development clearly directs the values and regulations that are aimed for. The theory of modernization was formed on a basis of the experiences of the earlier industrialized countries, particularly the United States. In contrast, the theory of internally-generated development is built around the experiences of the later industrializing economies, the nonaligned and the developing economies. Another contrasting point is that while the theories of modernization are general theories, the theories of internally-generated development are attempts to theorize on a low level of abstraction based on case studies of directed social change that is occurring in different regions. The works of Ishikawa Sanshiro and Edward Carpenter can be ranked as case studies on the theory of internally-generated development.

These theories of internally-generated development take a geographical region as their unit of analysis. Region indicates a geographical area smaller than a nation-state but not necessarily one that is part of a nation-state. Tamanoi Yoshiro defined regionalism as "when the people in a certain area, against a backdrop of distinctness in custom, have feelings of solidarity with the community in that region and seek its political, economic and cultural independence."[1] He uses the phrase "internally-generated regional orientation" to distinguish this brand of regionalism from its other forms and to emphasize the self-governing nature of people in the region.

Tamanoi also made the "resident" the supporter of the region: "When one takes the perspective of the person who is physically present in that world, the supporter of the region, and when one focuses on what the resident should be, there comes into clear relief not just the concepts of state and nation, but a clear picture of the faces and the behavior of the people who live there, those who have responsibility for its daily affairs. The residents create, sustain and protect life in an everyday ecological environment that is made from the soil and water of their region."[2] Tamanoi limits the region to a small geographical area and understands it as a real body because he emphasizes that this is where people carry out their lives on a foundation provided by local land and water. However, when one takes the concept of the small area as a limited body, and when the region is redefined by taking into consideration its relations with other regions, the concept of region can then be superimposed on the concept of community.

Jesse Bernard says that community must consist of three elements: 1) limited locale 2) common ties and 3) social interaction. When each of the three elements in this concept of community are taken into consideration, they can be interpreted as having these additional relationships: 1) permanent residential area, permanent residents and fixed standards of living, 2) shared thoughts, values and objectives, and 3) interaction between fixed residents and interaction be-

tween fixed residents visitors from outside. Bernard proposes that community can be divided into two categories, one when locale is emphasized that takes the definite article to become "the community," and the other without the limitations of place when the definite article can be dropped to become just "community." Community with the definite article, "the community" would pertain to groups that permanently reside in the area such as farmers, while community without the article would pertain to hunting and gathering societies. Bernard has constructed a paradigm for these two communities and gives results of his analysis on them.

As mentioned above, Ishikawa attempts to define community with his "composite net-shaped organization" and Carpenter gives his theories of social harmonization but with both the focus is on the points at which the net connects and these are theories of intrinsic value.

In addition to problems of subjectivity, some of the problems in these theories of intrinsic value are making regional individuality, internally-generated development and intrinsic regional values work together from the viewpoint of the individual continuity of civilization. Intrinsic value is "a physical constituent with the absolute power to support life. A bundle of wheat of fixed quality and weight contains within it measurable power to continuously sustain the human body. A cubic foot of clean air has the definite power to continuously support human body temperature."[3] Latent within this emphasis on inherent qualities of things is the notion that the physical material has a kind of individuality that does not exist in any other thing. People apply the knowledge of natural science to the individuality and diversity of things, thus diversifying the division of labor to the extent that the power that makes use of the individuality of things, and increases the possibility of selecting individuality in things. "All things are valued according to their intrinsic worth and nothing is valued according to its cost or rarity. There is also no room for any of the kinds of popular fashion to exist." Awareness of the diversity and individuality of intrinsic value provides the opportunities for internally generated development and internal spontaneity.

II. Theory of internally generated development in the theories of the arts and crafts movement

Ishikawa's theory of native arts and crafts was inspired by the work of William Morris (1834-96) the English poet and textile designer, especially from his [*How Shall We Live Then?* also possible is *The Lesser Art of Life*]. Morris was born ten years before Carpenter but they both joined the Social Democratic Federation established in London in the 1880s and his

awareness of crisis took place about the same time as Carpenter's.[4] His problem awareness was in the same phase as that of Ishikawa and the task that he assigns himself in "Theory of Native Art" of pursuing beauty in ordinary life can be expressed in the phrase "turning life into art." Morris was grounded in the English romantics and he accepted the criticism of "inhuman human relationships" that govern the economy civilized society as stated by Carlisle in *Past and Present* (1843) depicted in non human relationship human relationship economic situation ruled by civilized society and pointed out that art must be an integral part of the daily lives of the masses. Carlisle was extremely metaphorical about human values in civilized society but he contrasted humans and horses in the severity of reality saying that humans are led around by machines in the same way that a horse is pulled by bridle and bit," criticizing the inhumane setup of human relations in which people are forced to acquire the abilities so that they can do things as instructed by others and so that they can work to achieve the assigned goals.

The idea that people are part of the gears of a machine is related to the problem of the alienation of labor in a society where the priority is on industrial efficiency, but the problems that Carlisle and Ruskin talked about where taken by Morris to mean that development of arts and crafts in which the focus would be on intrinsic values and economic activity that made labor more human.

At one time, the people of the Renaissance separated art from daily life and raised it to its highest form of expression, but whether this made at a value for life, Morris would have said "no", and that arts and crafts had to be an intrinsic part of daily life. Art is also a daily labor that must be carried out constantly and this is part of the "joy of creation" that is an important element of art. That arises out of the fundamental criticism that Morris made of the way labor functions in industrial capitalist society, which called this era the "century of commerce." He joined the association for the preservation of traditional buildings and put great effort into saving ancient structures and in doing so, contrasted the way of the artist in contemporary civilization with that of the middle ages and ancient times and reexamined the relations between human beings and things in the "century of commerce." This was an all-inclusive issue that contained the problems of life in relation to art, existing patterns of labor and the relation between art and society. It has a great deal in common with Ishikawa's "Theory of native art."

As mentioned above, the earth that Ishikawa puts forth in his "native life, means not just the actual foundation of nature, but also has the meaning of direct participation in production as the place where things are created. For that reason the term "native" is not limited to just the farmer but is widely applied to all residents who are in engaged in production, and within the native is

an idee force that is a spontaneously generating power. How is this internal spontaneous force manifested? That will differ according to the various levels of subjective awareness along with the problem of intrinsic quality in multidimensional phenomenon. The reproduction of intrinsic quality is an intention of "native art" because no two intrinsic qualities can be expressed in the same way and thus, one intrinsic quality cannot be exchanged for another. This theory of intrinsic value is also emphasized in the logic of art and society according to Morris. There are of course influences from Ruskin in that, but Ruskin provides the words "intrinsic value" as one of the concepts of efficiency and use value in the field of economics. This phrase is often translated as intrinsic value or inherent value but it indicates the value of such things as the finances of an individual unit, and is also called intrinsic value assets. Ikegami Takashi[5] observes that Ruskin's employment of this term in social and cultural fields, allows use value and efficiency to be seen not just from the economic, but form a much broader perspective and thus a problem arises for the producer who employs art and culture in building the region and for the understanding of that art and culture in the relationship with the average citizen who is subject to it. This means that a region which recognizes and is subject to the qualities art and culture provides an interest in beauty to the resident and creates an emotional impact from contact with beauty, and in the words of Ishikawa, creates a separation caused by the excitement of beauty.

Ishikawa avoided haste in bringing the issues of beauty into politics and society. His intention in developing a theory of art for the problems surrounding shared intellect, was to hypothesize a concrete "multiple net structure"[6] that would bring together all of the different individual characteristics and to use the perspectives of internally generated development for particular regions. The theory of internally generated development will be examined further in the final section, but without disconnecting the human awareness from the labor of those living in the region, it questions whether they receive the joy of creating things. As a clue to embarking on the extremely deep question of how internal truth is changed in the way that labor is performed as a method that gives priority to convenience to derive economic effect and financial value, Ishikawa presents the question of beauty, and questions regional culture and environment, calling to the awareness of individual beauty that resides within each individual in each area, but a multiple problem awareness is working there which is oriented toward waking the awareness of internal and external.

Morris lived at the same time as Carpenter and turned his attention toward the art of the ancients and of the middle age, highly praising the rich artistic merit of work done by unknown

artisans, painters and craftsmen. However, in doing so he took up the question of "internal rhythm" in that handicraft. When a person immerses himself in such handicraft,[7] he goes beyond the internal rhythm, working without hurry, relaxed and allowed to concentrate on what he is doing. In other words, when making a product the person's entire being enters into that product and the product is not a sum of small parts. This is not diverting one's self to put everything into making one thing it must be understood as the result of putting all of one's knowledge according to ability into a thing so that what is created is something of high artistic worth. This is a criticism not of labor as an activity that is the total sum of the human being but of the separation from knowledge or creating beauty that is disconnected from knowledge and artistic quality.[8]

When seen from this perspective, the question of intrinsic worth is closely related to the pursuit of individual identity and although this has no connection to whether identity was originally used in intrinsic value, and it is pointed out that one's power resides there and that unique power does not exist in any other thing. He then evaluates the latent ability that resides within things and considers as important the qualities that contribute to the development of human life. He also asserts that along with scientific qualities, things, have artistic quality.

That is also related to the problem of the ability to receive intrinsic worth, and is, according to Ishikawa, the main axis in the logic of art and society that encompasses the ides force as the internally generated power.

III. The possibilities of internally generated development

An important part of internally generated development is the course by which cultural assets or tradition is remade. Tradition is something that is handed down from generation to generation within a region or a group and there is particular emphasis on the accumulation of the group knowledge that appears in the traditions of a specific group.[9] Tradition has many aspects: 1) the formation of a structure of awareness, which is formation of thoughts, beliefs and values that are handed down from generation to generation, 2) the formation of social relations that is handed down from generation to generation, i.e., the formation of a structure of relationships between families, villages and towns, 3) the formation of the techniques for making all kinds of things necessary in food, clothing and housing. How are these aspects transformed when necessity creates a new situation out of traditional norms? Case study research in the theory of internally-generated development is used to analyze that process of change and through that

analysis one can learn what agents caused the transformation.

In answering the question of what standards could be used to determine the superiority of a tradition, Ichii Sanshiro proposed setting up value standards and said, "we must reduce as much as possible the pain felt when there is no need for someone (scientifically — Homo Sapiens) to take responsibility."[10] If we are not the people who can select and accept our own pain in order to reduce pain, then we cannot reduce absurd suffering. The person who can do that is what Ichii calls a "key person."

Ichii categories key persons as being of two types the intellectual key person and the practical key person. It is possible that both elements can exist in one person. The key person is one who can look into the minor traditions existing in the region, and discover from them a special key for the solving the problems humankind now faces. This remaking of old forms to fit the new environment will open the way to a wide range of progress.

The problem awareness common to both Ishikawa Sanshiro and Edward Carpenter is something that still remains in an unfinished stage, i.e., that of grasping society in its entirety, determining one's own position within those problems and placing nature within that route to find the clues to a solution.[11] Having the elements of both intellectual and practical key person will allow the soil of the region to be cultivated and the paths towards internally generated development to be laid during a very critical situation in time.

Carrying this out would require devising a means to restore human nature in its entirety to a state of harmony between original nature and social nature. The usual appearance of an ideal requires the independent formation of free individuals who can take up its burden. However, that free individual is not free of the state and world systems that would be the structures supporting his or her existence. Those systems develop and become more advanced and in doing so it demolish the foundations for life created so far. The individual is enclosed within specialized circumstances that are inside the social relations that have grown here. There is very little feeling on the part of the human that could be called an existence in reality. Both Ishikawa and Carpenter were eminently aware of how dangerous such a situation is. Their attempts at creating a native situation and the formation of thought common to both is what lends possibility to internally generated development in a situation of crisis and why the course that they described still remains valid.

Footnotes

(1) Yoshiro Tamanoi, *Chiiki Bunka no Shiso*, Toyokeizaishinposha, 1977, p. 7 cf. Tsurumi Kazuko,

"Naihatsuteki hattenron no tenkai" Chikumashobo, 1996

(2) Yoshiro Tamanoi, *Chiikishugi no tenkai*, Nouson Gyoson Bunka kyokai, 1977, p. 119

(3) Ibid., p. 121

(4) This idea of Carpenter had major effects on the thought of Ishikawa Sanshiro, who searched for a method that will enhance the path and that method is direct interaction with nature by making it an intrinsic part of the production site. In his criticism of modern capitalism, Ishikawa does not use the word "nature" simply as a term in contradistinction with "civilization." He seeked to open the path to liberation for those who are under the control of the present system. cf. Edward Carpenter, Civilization: Its Cause and Cure, London, 1889 pp. 10-11

(5) Ikegami Atsushi, *Seikatsu no Geijutsuka*, Maruzen, 1993, p. 65

(6) Ibid., p. 69

(7) Ibid., p. 66

(8) Ibid., pp. 73-74

(9) Yoshiro Tamanoi, *Chiikishugi no tenkai*, Nouson Gyoson Bunka kyokai, 1977, p. 109

(10) Ichii Saburo, Fukawa Seiji, Dentoteki Kakushinshisoron, Heibonsha, 1988, p. 67

(11) Carpenter was not reticent about his philosophy or about the image of human nature derived from it. Quite explicitly Carpenter refused to separate the human race from the rest of nature. Rather the whole universe was expression of a purposive mystical entity. Humanity's orle in this scheme was both prodigal son and saviour inside nature and yet at the same time capable of viewing it from the outside, human experience was to be the agency through which the connectedness of thing was to be celebrated and the shattered wholeness of the cosmos to be reintegrated. Human experience was a microcosm of the deep reality of things:

> . . . there is in Man a Creative Thought-source continually in operation, which is shaping and giving from not only to his body, but largely to the world in which he lives. In fact, the houses, the gardens, the streets among which we live, the clothes we wear, the books we read, have been produced from this source. (Edward Carpenter, *The Art of Creation*, 1904, pp. 24-5)

Nature's unity would then stem from a common origin and the myriad forms of life could be seen as a scale of being along which the creative will have expressed itself. This view gave equal dignity and status to all the manifestations of creation. Our experience of the world was not really an encounter with the Other; instead it was an epiphany between one manifestation of the Great Self and another. There was no form life too humble to be an expression of the cosmic purpose: "Every oyster has its fads and fancies." (E. Carpenter, *Angel's Wing*, 1898, p. 127)

But if every individual had a value, it was not as isolated and lonely atoms that possessed this worth. Carpenter recorded the teaching of his own gnani (spiritual teacher) with enthusiasm: one should not speak of helping other, for although the practice was praise-worthy, this form of speech encouraged the delusion that "you and they were twain." (E. Carpenter, *From Adam's Park to Flephants*, 1898, p. 177) Nor were the elements and processes of inorganic matter separate either. In diversity there was also unity. (c.f. Christopher E. Shaw "Identified with the One" Prose Studies, 1991)

References

Celso Furtado, "Underdevelopment and Dependence: The Fundamental Connection," Working Papers, No. 17, Centre of Latin American Studies, University of Cambridge, 1973

Clark Kerr et al. *Industrialism and Industrial Man*, Oxford University Press, 1964

Dudley Seers, "The Meaning of Development," the Institute of Development studies at the University

of Sussex, December, 1969

Dudley Seers, "The New Meaning of Development," the Institute of Development studies at the University of Sussex, March, 1977

Ikegami Atsushi, *Seikatsu no Geijutsuka*, Maruzen, 1993, Tsurumi Kazuko, "Aspects of Endogenous Development in Modern Japan: Part 1, Social Structure, Part II, Religion Beliefs. Part III, Man, Nature, and Technology," Research Papers Series A-36, A-37., A-38, Institute of International Relations, Sophia University, 1979

Tsurumi Kazuko, *Naihatsuteki hattenron no tenkai* Chikumashobo, 1996